Career Framework for Advancing University Teaching
A Global Movement Towards Rewarding Teaching Excellence
www.teachingframework.com

JULIA C. LEE
Harvard John A Paulson School of Engineering & Applied Sciences
Member of Royal Academy of Engineering Career Framework Working Group for this study
WITH FEEDBACK FROM EXPERTS & U. LEADERSHIP ACROSS MULTIPLE INSTITUTIONS & DISCIPLINES INCLUDING MEDICINE, ETC.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ASIA</th>
<th>AUSTRALIA</th>
<th>EUROPE</th>
<th>SOUTH AMERICA</th>
<th>UNITED STATES</th>
<th>UNITED KINGDOM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NUS, Singapore</td>
<td>UNSW</td>
<td>Dutch Govt.</td>
<td>UTEC, Peru</td>
<td>(Harvard, SEAS/FAS)</td>
<td>Royal Academy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UTM, Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
<td>U. Twente, NL</td>
<td>(PUC, Chile)</td>
<td>(MIT)</td>
<td>U. College London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skoltech, Russia</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chalmers, Sweden</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Imperial College)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>DTU, Denmark</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(U. Edinburgh)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Julia C. Lee
**LEAD**
**DR. RUTH GRAHAM**
**CONSULTANT**
**2015-18**

**WITH FEEDBACK FROM EXPERTS & U. LEADERSHIP ACROSS MULTIPLE INSTITUTIONS & DISCIPLINES INCLUDING MEDICINE, ETC.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ASIA</th>
<th>AUSTRALIA</th>
<th>EUROPE</th>
<th>SOUTH AMERICA</th>
<th>UNITED STATES</th>
<th>UNITED KINGDOM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NUS, Singapore</td>
<td>UNSW</td>
<td>Dutch Govt.</td>
<td>UTEC, Peru</td>
<td>(Harvard, SEAS/FAS)</td>
<td>Royal Academy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UTM, Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
<td>U. Twente, NL</td>
<td>(PUC, Chile)</td>
<td>(MIT)</td>
<td>U. College London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skoltech, Russia</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chalmers, Sweden</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Imperial College)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>DTU, Denmark</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(U. Edinburgh)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(EPFL, Switzerland)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Julia C. Lee
Motivation for Developing Framework

- Acknowledgement that little current incentive to improve teaching
- Government Mandates [e.g. Gold, Silver, Bronz stars in UK]
- Student demands for better teaching as fees are increased
  (On-line learning resources: e.g. EdX, Coursera etc.)

A: threshold for acceptable level of teaching
B: threshold for leadership in teaching and learning
THE RAE CAREER FRAMEWORK FOR UNIVERSITY TEACHING

A Metric for Evaluating Teaching Achievement
The RAE Career Framework for University Teaching

For each level of teaching achievement, the Framework addresses the following three questions:

- what is the academic’s sphere of impact in their teaching and learning activities?
- what promotion criteria define the academic’s achievements in teaching and learning?
- what forms of evidence can be used to demonstrate the academic’s teaching achievements?
The Career Framework for University Teaching

ROLES

LEVEL 4
National / global leader in teaching & learning

LEVEL 3
Institutional leader in teaching & learning

Scholarly teacher

LEVEL 2
Skilled & collegial teacher

LEVEL 1
Effective teacher

SPHERES OF IMPACT (CUMULATIVE)

National / global education community

Educational knowledge

Local or institutional education environment

Academic colleagues

Students

Julia C. Lee
The Career Framework for University Teaching

**ROLES**

- **LEVEL 4**: National / global leader in teaching & learning
- **LEVEL 3**: Institutional leader in teaching & learning, Scholarly teacher
- **LEVEL 2**: Skilled & collegial teacher
- **LEVEL 1**: Effective teacher

**SPHERES OF IMPACT (CUMULATIVE)**

- National / global education community
- Local or institutional education environment
- Educational knowledge
- Academic colleagues
- Students

Julia C. Lee
## Example Forms of Evidence for Promotion

### Approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self-assessment</th>
<th>Professional activities</th>
<th>Measures of student learning</th>
<th>Peer review and recognition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|National and global leader| Reflects on their national and global influence in teaching and learning, and their impact on advancing educational knowledge, collaboration and/or excellence | Sources listed for Institutional Leader in Teaching and Learning, plus:  
- Participation in government consultation committees  
- Invited speaker at national/global events in teaching and learning  
- Participation in and leadership of high-impact national and global educational programmes | Sources listed for Institutional Leader in Teaching and Learning, plus:  
- Publications, citations, research grants and income within the field of teaching and learning  
- National and global press coverage  
- National/global awards and prizes |
|Institutional leader| Reflects on how their leadership in teaching and learning has helped to create an inclusive, supportive and aspirational learning environment that advances student learning | Sources listed for Skilled and Collegial Teacher, plus:  
- Leadership role in strategic institutional curriculum and/or policy development  
- Design and delivery of high-impact course innovation  
- Leadership of QA or accreditation processes  
- External reviewer/trainer/advisor | Sources listed for Skilled and Collegial Teacher, plus:  
- Assessments made by graduate recruiters and employers  
- Students’ self-reported learning gains, student engagement surveys (programme or institutional level)  
- Programme pass rates/progression rates  
- Concept tests or standardised tests (programme level) |
|Scholarly teacher| Reflects on their personal teaching philosophy, describing how evidence-informed approaches are used to contribute to both student learning and pedagogical knowledge | Sources listed for Skilled and Collegial Teacher, plus:  
- Active use of ‘Action Research’ methods in their teaching practices  
- Invited speaker at key events in teaching and learning  
- Reviewer of scientific papers and articles about teaching and learning within and/or beyond own discipline  
- Visitors/honorary position held at other institutions  
- Active member of teaching and learning research group | Sources listed for Skilled and Collegial Teacher, plus:  
- Students’ self-reported learning gains (course level)  
- Student engagement surveys (course level) |
|Skilled and collegial teacher| Reflects on their personal teaching philosophy and its development over time, as well as the role they play in nurturing an academic environment that advances educational excellence | Sources listed for Effective Teacher, plus:  
- Mentoring and peer-coaching of teaching colleagues  
- Participation in programmes of educational reform, innovation and/or development  
- Membership of institutional educational committees  
- External examiner/trainer  
- Participation in teaching and learning conferences/events within and/or beyond their school or discipline | Sources listed for Effective Teacher, plus:  
- Retrospective assessment by alumni  
- Assessments made by graduate recruiters and employers with respect to specific courses/experiences  
- Student and/or institutional prizes/achievements that can be linked to specific course/programme  
- Student learning journals  
- Concept tests (course level) |
|Effective teacher| Reflects on their educational approach and its development over time, identifying how it supports effective student learning in the context of the cohort, discipline and institution | Details of courses taught (student numbers, nature of teaching, assessment methods, etc.)  
- Details of student support and guidance provided  
- Participation in certification and training in teaching and learning  
- Samples of course materials  
- Construction of a teaching portfolio | Student evaluation surveys and student interview feedback  
- Informal and unsolicited student feedback  
- Participation in certification and training in teaching and learning  
- Evaluation of student products or projects  
- Peer observation teaching  
- Peer review of course content, objectives and materials and/or teaching portfolio  
- Review and letters of reference from teaching mentor  
- Letters of reference from: students, alumni, Director of Studies, Head of School and course/programme leaders |
UNIVERSITIES AND THE FRAMEWORK
Governments & the Framework

Universiti Teknologi Malaysia (UTM)

Following a call from the national government, all Malaysian universities are developing new unified academic career pathways.

UTM is using the Framework to inform its radical overhaul of its career pathways and academic reward systems. These will be rolled out in early 2019.

Comenius Grant Scheme
Ministry of Education, Netherlands

Launched in 2017, this national bursary scheme is designed to support innovation in university teaching. The Framework was used to inform the three ‘tiers’ of fellowship offered:

1. Teaching Fellow (€50k grants)
2. Senior Teaching Fellow (€100k grants)
3. Leadership Fellow (€250k grants)
Governingns & The Framework

**Comenius Grant Scheme**

**Ministry of Education, Netherlands**

Launched in 2017, this national bursary scheme is designed to support innovation in university teaching. The Framework was used to inform the three ‘tiers’ of fellowship offered:

1. Teaching Fellow (€50k grants)
2. Senior Teaching Fellow (€100k grants)
3. Leadership Fellow (€250k grants)
Governments & the Framework

2017 Comenius Awards

- Total budget €6M
- 74 projects
- 350 letters of intent / 247 proposals
- 46 Teaching Fellows
- 22 Senior Fellows
- 6 Leadership Fellows

Comenius Grant Scheme
Ministry of Education, Netherlands

Launched in 2017, this national bursary scheme is designed to support innovation in university teaching. The Framework was used to inform the three ‘tiers’ of fellowship offered:

1. Teaching Fellow (€50k grants)
2. Senior Teaching Fellow (€100k grants)
3. Leadership Fellow (€250k grants)
30+ known universities using framework since April publication to inform/enact change
The dual-population of faculty at FAS

Ladder Faculty
- Research and teaching
- ~730 total for 40+ subjects

Non-Ladder Faculty
- Primarily teaching
- ~320 total

- Professor (tenured)
- Associate Professor (tenured track)
- Assistant Professor (tenure track)

- Senior Preceptor
- Senior Lecturer

- Preceptor (no PhD required)
- Lecturer

Taken from Tamara Brenner 2017 RAE presentation, with slight modifications
Rough Expectations for Harvard Non-Ladder Faculty?

Professor of the Practice
Senior Lecturer
(Certain Faculty voting rights)

Senior Preceptor

Lecturer
(PhD)

Preceptor
(no PhD required)
Super Teaching Assistant
FRAMEWORK (MODIFIED) RELEVANT FOR HARVARD?

• To support non-ladder careers whether internal or external to Harvard

• As a means to reward > baseline level teaching of ladder faculty

• If so, how can we support and incentivize?
  • E.g. Help build a “portable” teaching profile
FRAMEWORK NEXT STEPS

• Implementation toolkit – 9 months
• Longitudinal survey to assess teaching culture (12 top research led universities signed on) – 2019-23

• Develop suite of metrics to assess teaching achievement at institutional level (e.g. for global university rankings)

• Collaboration on external peer review
• Extending the framework scope to cover all academic activities (research, innovation, administration)
GOALS TODAY

• How do we support ALL faculty to be better teachers?

• How do we incentivize ALL faculty to improve teaching?
**Supporting / Incentivizing Faculty**

1. What might be useful in **helping / incentivizing** faculty improve their teaching practice?

2. In your own/school context, what challenges/obstacles do you see to **helping / incentivizing** faculty improve their teaching practice?

3. What are promising practices (in your context or elsewhere) for **helping / incentivizing** faculty improve their teaching practice?

4. Should we support this at the department, school or university level? If yes, how, and do we devise different support to different cohorts (e.g. ladder vs. non-ladder)

5. What particularly important ideas emerged in your discussion that you’d like to share with the larger group?